



HMAS *Success* Commission of Inquiry

Allegations of Unacceptable Behaviour and the Management Thereof

Part Three: Further Recommendations



PART THREE

Redacted report made available to the public following
authorisation by the Minister for Defence under Regulation 63(3)
of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985.

PRESIDENT
THE HONOURABLE
ROGER GYLES AO QC

DECEMBER 2011



REDACTED VERSION

HMAS *Success* Commission of Inquiry

Allegations of Unacceptable Behaviour and the Management Thereof

Part Three: Further Recommendations

Redacted report made available to the public following
authorisation by the Minister for Defence under Regulation 63(3)
of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985.

President
The Honourable Roger Gyles AO QC

December 2011

© Commonwealth of Australia 2011

This work is copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968*, no part may be reproduced by any process without prior written permission from the Commonwealth. Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to the Commonwealth Copyright Administration, Attorney-General's Department, National Circuit, Barton ACT 2600 or posted at <http://www.ag.gov.au/cca>.

HMAS *Success* Commission of Inquiry
Allegations of Unacceptable Behaviour and the Management Thereof

ISBN 978-0-642-29758-7

Part Three: Further Recommendations

ISBN 978-0-642-29736-5

Part One: The Asian Deployment and Immediate Aftermath

ISBN 978-0-642-29742-6

Part Two: The Management of the Allegations and Personnel Involved



HMAS Success Commission of Inquiry
Office of the Chief of the Defence Force
Level 18, 270 Pitt St
Defence Plaza Sydney
Sydney NSW 2000

General DJ Hurley AC DSC

Chief of the Defence Force
R1-5-B CDF Suite
Department of Defence
Canberra ACT 2600

Dear General Hurley

By Instrument of Appointment dated 9 March 2010, pursuant to Regulation 109 of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985, Air Chief Marshal Houston appointed me to constitute a Commission of Inquiry and, pursuant to Regulation 112, appointed me President of the Commission of Inquiry.

I was appointed to 'inquire into the alleged incidents of unacceptable behaviour, as defined in applicable Defence Instructions, or other behaviour which could compromise the safety and effectiveness of the crew onboard HMAS Success that were brought to the attention of command between March and May 2009, and issues associated with the subsequent management of such allegations and of personnel allegedly involved'. I dealt with those matters in Parts One and Two of my report.

On 28 September 2010 Air Chief Marshal Houston also asked that I provide my views, formed as a result of this Commission, in relation to broader considerations. I therefore deliver Part Three of my report, containing those views and recommendations based on them.

Yours sincerely



Roger Gyles AO QC
President

23 December 2011

Contents

Acknowledgments.....	vi
Executive summary and recommendations.....	vii
1 Introduction	1
2 Erosion of command?	3
What is command?	3
Military discipline	8
Investigation.....	9
Prosecution.....	11
Redress of grievance	15
Command decisions and administrative law	20
Equity and diversity and unacceptable behaviour	25
Equity and diversity.....	26
The Defence Equity Adviser Network	29
Defence policy on 'unacceptable behaviour'	33
The policy on reporting and managing 'unacceptable behaviour'	39
History of Defence policy on equity and diversity.....	42
History of Defence policy on unacceptable behaviour	47
Other policy documents dealing with equity and diversity	49
Summary.....	52
Quick Assessments and Routine Inquiries.....	57
Quick Assessments	57
Routine Inquiries	61
3 Inquiries pursuant to the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations	65
General	65
Some reform proposals.....	68
Appearances and representation	68
Confidentiality	71
Appendix A Instrument of appointment.....	75
Appendix B Part One of the report: executive summary.....	83
Appendix C Part Two of the report: executive summary	95
Appendix D Outline of reforms.....	107
Appendix E Conduct of the Commission	121
Appendix F Practice Note Number 1.....	125
Appendix G Contributors to the Commission	129
Sources consulted	131
Shortened forms.....	153