



---

# HMAS *Success* Commission of Inquiry

Allegations of Unacceptable Behaviour and the Management Thereof

Part Two: The Management of the Allegations and Personnel Involved

---



## PART TWO

Redacted report made available to the public following  
authorisation by the Minister for Defence under Regulation 63(3)  
of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985 on 5 July 2011.

PRESIDENT  
THE HONOURABLE  
ROGER GYLES AO QC

**MAY 2011**



# REDACTED VERSION

---

## HMAS *Success* Commission of Inquiry

Allegations of Unacceptable Behaviour and the Management Thereof

Part Two: The Management of the Allegations and Personnel Involved

---

Redacted report made available to the public following authorisation by the Minister for Defence under Regulation 63(3) of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985 on 5 July 2011.

President  
The Honourable Roger Gyles AO QC

**May 2011**

© Commonwealth of Australia 2011

This work is copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968*, no part may be reproduced by any process without prior written permission from the Commonwealth. Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to the Commonwealth Copyright Administration, Attorney-General's Department, National Circuit, Barton ACT 2600 or posted at <http://www.ag.gov.au/cca>.

HMAS *Success* Commission of Inquiry

Allegations of Unacceptable Behaviour and the Management Thereof

ISBN 978-0-642-29742-6

Part Two: The Management of the Allegations and Personnel Involved



HMAS Success Commission of Inquiry  
Office of the Chief of the Defence Force  
Level 18, 270 Pitt St  
Defence Plaza Sydney  
Sydney NSW 2000

Air Chief Marshal AG Houston AC AFC  
Chief of the Defence Force  
R1-5-B CDF Suite  
Department of Defence  
Canberra ACT 2600

Dear Air Chief Marshal Houston

By Instrument of Appointment dated 9 March 2010, pursuant to Regulation 109 of the Defence (Inquiry) Regulations 1985, you appointed me to constitute a Commission of Inquiry and, pursuant to Regulation 112, appointed me President of the Commission of Inquiry.

I was appointed to 'inquire into the alleged incidents of unacceptable behaviour, as defined in applicable Defence Instructions, or other behaviour which could compromise the safety and effectiveness of the crew onboard HMAS Success that were brought to the attention of command between March and May 2009, and issues associated with the subsequent management of such allegations and of personnel allegedly involved'.

As arranged, I deliver Part Two of my report, dealing with the subsequent management of the allegations and personnel involved, accompanied by a succinct executive summary of that part of my report.

Yours sincerely

Roger Gyles AO, QC  
President

30 May 2011



# Contents

Executive summary .....	vii
<b>1 Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2 The Wark inquiry .....</b>	<b>3</b>
The appointment .....	3
The inquiry and report .....	7
Command decisions .....	16
Redresses of grievance .....	18
Decisions on redresses of grievance .....	20
The redress of grievance procedure .....	23
The basis for decisions: the Griffin advice .....	28
Senate Committee matters .....	48
The Head of Defence Legal's advice .....	54
General .....	55
<b>3 Management of the landed sailors .....</b>	<b>59</b>
Administrative support and arrangements for the landed sailors .....	59
Legal support for the landed sailors .....	60
Requests for reasons for landing .....	61
Requests for disclosure of the Wark report and the evidence relied on .....	84
Freedom of information requests .....	94
Requests for access to the ship and its company .....	98
The joint complaint of 15 July and the Houston Routine Inquiry .....	106
The redresses of grievance .....	120
[REDACTED] equity and diversity complaint .....	126
Subsequent management of [REDACTED] complaint against [REDACTED] .....	127
<b>4 Media repercussions .....</b>	<b>131</b>
The media approach and the ensuing publicity .....	132
The freedom of information request .....	154
The Houston inquiry: 28 September 2009 .....	157
Further political and media interest .....	158
Effect of the media reports on the landed senior sailors .....	166
Conclusion .....	169
Annexure A Radio and television broadcasts, 4 July 2009 .....	172
Annexure B Newspaper articles, 5 July 2009 .....	173
Annexure C Radio and television broadcasts, 5 July .....	174
Annexure D Radio and television broadcasts, 6 July 2009 .....	178

Annexure E	Newspaper articles, 6 July 2009 .....	181
Annexure F	Radio broadcasts, 7 and 8 July 2009.....	182
Annexure G	Television broadcasts, 7 to 14 July 2009 .....	183
Annexure H	Newspaper articles, 7 to 14 July 2009 .....	184
Annexure I	Some print media stories, October 2009 .....	185
<b>5</b>	<b>Treatment of the Legal Officer.....</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>The ADFIS investigations .....</b>	<b>199</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>205</b>
<b>Appendix A</b>	<b>Instrument of appointment.....</b>	<b>213</b>
<b>Appendix B</b>	<b>Notification to [REDACTED].....</b>	<b>221</b>
<b>Appendix C</b>	<b>The Wark report: summary, findings and recommendations.....</b>	<b>223</b>
<b>Appendix D</b>	<b>The Weber report.....</b>	<b>237</b>
	<b>Shortened forms .....</b>	<b>261</b>